

# A Motet Wrongly Attributed to Adrian Willaert<sup>1</sup>

BENJAMIN ORY

Scholars have long been fascinated by the single surviving altus partbook from the *Libro primo de la fortuna* and the edition's place in the development of polyphonic music printing.<sup>2</sup> The *Libro primo*, which contains Adrian Willaert's famous puzzle motet *Quid non ebrietas*, has been the focus of more than a century of research.<sup>3</sup> But our knowledge of the print's contents remains uneven. In comparison to the rich discourse on *Quid non ebrietas*, much less is known about the piece that precedes it, *Nigra sum*, save that it is also often attributed to Willaert in three standard work-lists: *Grove Music Online*, both editions of *Die Musik in Geschichte und Gegenwart*, and David Kidger's *Adrian Willaert: A Guide to Research*.<sup>4</sup> As such, I tentatively assigned *Nigra sum* to a volume of the Willaert collected-works edition that I am editing (*Corpus Mensurabilis Musicae* 3, vol. 11).<sup>5</sup>

A closer examination of this motet reveals that there is no attribution to Willaert in the *Libro primo*, but that there is only a modern scholarly history of thinking there is one. This circumstance invites critical engagement with what this essay will term the 'tacit attribution fallacy'. An investigation of the motet reveals two new concordances in sixteenth-century northern Italian manuscripts, one of which names as its composer Paolo Ferrarese, for whose music the only printing contract from cinquecento Venice survives. The details uncovered below demonstrate that *Nigra sum* should never have been linked with Willaert's name, for which reason the motet will not feature in the collected-works edition. At the same time, the new concordances that I have found make it clear that the piece was originally scored for three voices, with two *si placet* voices added later.

<sup>1</sup> Thanks to Joshua Rifkin and Jesse Rodin for their comments on this article. All abbreviations of primary sources used within the article are expanded in Appendix 1, together with links to digital images of the sources, when available.

<sup>2</sup> On the *Libro primo de la fortuna*, see Emil Vogel, *Biblioteca della musica vocale Italiana di genere profano stampata dal 1500 al 1700*, 2 vols. (Berlin, 1892), vol. 2, 379; Alfred Einstein, 'Bibliography of Italian Secular Vocal Music Printed between the Years 1500-1700 (Second Installment)', in *Notes, Second Series* 2 (1945), 275-90, esp. 285; Alfred Einstein, *The Italian Madrigal*, 3 vols., trans. Alexander H. Krappe, Roger H. Sessions, and Oliver Strunk (Princeton, 1949), vol. 1, 149; Knud Jeppesen, *La Frottola. Bemerkungen zur Bibliographie der ältesten weltlichen Notendrucke in Italien*, 3 vols. (Copenhagen, 1968-70), vol. 1, 71, 74-75, and 141; Iain Fenlon and James Haar, *The Italian Madrigal in the Early Sixteenth Century* (Cambridge, 1988), 218-20; Bonnie J. Blackburn, 'Two Treasure Chests of Canonic Antiquities: The Collections of Hermann Finck and Lodovico Zacconi', in *Canons and Canonic Techniques, 14th-16th Centuries: Theory, Practice, and Reception History*, ed. Katelijne Schiltz and Bonnie J. Blackburn (Leuven, 2007), 303-38, esp. 323-25.

<sup>3</sup> On *Quid non ebrietas*, see Edward E. Lowinsky, 'Adrian Willaert's Chromatic "Duo" Re-Examined', in *Tijdschrift der Vereeniging voor Nederlandsche Muziekgeschiedenis* 18 (1956), 1-36; and most recently, Peter Urquhart, *Sound and Sense in Franco-Flemish Music of the Renaissance: Sharps, Flats, and the Problem of Musica Ficta* (Leuven, 2021), 516-19.

<sup>4</sup> Walter Gerstenberg, 'Willaert, Adrian', in *Die Musik in Geschichte und Gegenwart*, ed. Friedrich Blume (Kassel, 1968), vol. 14, 662-76, esp. 665; Jessie Ann Owens, Lewis Lockwood, Giulio Ongaro, and Michele Fromson, 'Willaert [Vuigliart, etc.], Adrian [Adriano]', in *Grove Music Online*, <<http://www.oxfordmusiconline.com>> (accessed 24 September 2023); David M. Kidger, *Adrian Willaert: A Guide to Research* (New York, 2005), 72; Wolfgang Horn, 'Willaert, Adrian', in *Die Musik in Geschichte und Gegenwart Online*, <<https://www.mgg-online.com>> (accessed 24 September 2023).

<sup>5</sup> The volume will be published by the American Institute of Musicology and will feature motets that appeared up to the year 1534 in printed anthologies and manuscripts.

## Willaert and the Tacit Attribution Fallacy

Probably one quarter of all the works attributed in sixteenth-century sources to Willaert remains unpublished in modern notation.<sup>6</sup> Many circulated only in manuscripts or printed anthologies and thus have not so far featured in the Willaert collected-works edition, which up to now has focused on music in Venetian single-author prints. *Nigra sum*, which was thought to be a *unicum* in the *Libro primo de la fortuna*, has thus been neglected. All we know about it is that an attribution to Willaert—so Kidger has claimed—is implied in the *Libro primo*'s table of contents (attributions in this source are not supplied on the music pages themselves).<sup>7</sup>

We know relatively little about the *Libro primo*. Only the altus survives: the full title of the edition, the dedication, the colophon, and the date would have probably been transmitted by the missing cantus and tenor partbooks. At the top of folios 2<sup>r</sup>, 3<sup>r</sup>, and 4<sup>r</sup> in the partbook, the designation 'cantus' is given, almost surely a printing error. The print features a jumble of repertoires: an initial layer of five motets in different dispositions is followed by nineteen secular works (Table 1 offers information about the *Libro primo*'s motets). But similarities between the *Libro primo* and the single superius partbook *Messa motteti Canzonni Novamente stampate Libro Primo* offer clues as to the *Libro primo*'s origins: both prints imitate editions of Ottaviano Petrucci in the design of their initials and in their use of double impression technique.<sup>8</sup> On this basis, Knud Jeppesen plausibly suggested about half a century ago that the two prints were published in the same place at around the same time, and by the same printer: that is, in Rome c. 1526, and by Niccolò de' Giudici, as stated by *Messa motteti*'s dedication.<sup>9</sup>

As noted, examining the table of contents for the *Libro primo de la fortuna* demonstrates that Giudici did not attribute *Nigra sum* to Willaert. In the index, each composer's name is placed directly before the title of the piece, and no composer's name is placed directly before *Nigra sum*. The assumption of Willaert's authorship relies on the attribution of the previous motet, *In tua patientia permanens*, and from the next piece, *Quid non ebrietas*, also attributed to Willaert (Figure 1). But if a name in the index was designed to apply to all the pieces that follow up until the next attribution, there would be no need to repeat the 'Adrien' before *Quid non ebrietas*. Supporting evidence can also be found in the opposite column: *Se mai provasti donna* and *Fedele et bel cagnuolo*, which appear one after the next, each carry attributions to [Philippe] Verdelot. If Giudici employed tacit attributions, that is, if Giudici intended for an attribution of one piece to apply also to unattributed works printed immediately after, the second of

<sup>6</sup> Approximately sixty motets remain to be published in the Willaert collected-works edition, as do the chansons, the five- and six-voice masses, the Lamentations settings, the antiphons, the *ricercari*, the music for vespers and compline, a Passion setting, and the critical notes to the edition as a whole. A limited number of these works have appeared in other publications.

<sup>7</sup> Kidger, *Adrian Willaert*, 72.

<sup>8</sup> Jeppesen, *La Frottola*, vol. 1, 72-75; Knud Jeppesen, 'An Unknown Pre-Madrigalian Music Print in Relation to Other Contemporary Italian Sources (1520-1530)', trans. Lilian P. Pruett, in *Studies in Musicology: Essays in the History, Style, and Bibliography of Music in Memory of Glen Haydon*, ed. James W. Pruett (Westport, 1969), 3-17; Stanley Boorman, *Ottaviano Petrucci: A Catalogue Raisonné* (Oxford, 2006), 386-87.

<sup>9</sup> I adopt the spelling of the printer's name as found in the printing contract discovered for the now-lost *Libro primo de la salamandra*. Bonnie J. Blackburn, 'The Printing Contract for the *Libro primo de musica de la salamandra* (Rome, 1526)', in *Journal of Musicology* 12 (1994), 345-56, esp. 350.

Table 1. The opening five motets of the *Libro primo de la fortuna*

No.	Fols.	Motet	Voices	Composer	Concordances <sup>a</sup>
1	2 <sup>r</sup> -2 <sup>v</sup>	<i>Sancta Maria dei mater</i> <sup>b</sup>	4	Pierre Moulu	Pesaro 559 (fols. 161 <sup>v</sup> -62 <sup>v</sup> , attr. P. Moulu)
2	2 <sup>v</sup> -3 <sup>r</sup>	<i>In tua paciencia permanens</i>	4	Adrian Willaert	Bologna Q20 (fols. 13 <sup>v</sup> -14 <sup>r</sup> , attr. Adrian) <sup>c</sup> #London 2037 (fols. 49 <sup>v</sup> -50 <sup>r</sup> , attr. A vvillaert, in index Adrianus) °Padua A17 (fols. 153 <sup>v</sup> -54 <sup>r</sup> ) °Treviso 8 (fols. 37 <sup>v</sup> -38 <sup>r</sup> ) RISM 1538 <sup>5</sup> (fol. 30 <sup>v</sup> , attr. Adrian Vuillart) RISM 1540 <sup>6</sup> (series 2, no. 11, attr. Adrianus VVillart) RISM W 1107 (no. 15, fol. 8 <sup>r</sup> , attr. from print title Adriani Vvillaert)
3	3 <sup>r</sup> -3 <sup>v</sup>	<i>Nigra sum</i>	3-4		°Verona 760 (fols. 70 <sup>v</sup> -71 <sup>r</sup> ) °#Bologna R142 (fols. 21 <sup>v</sup> -22 <sup>v</sup> )
4	4 <sup>r</sup> -4 <sup>v</sup>	<i>Quid non ebrietas</i>	4	Adrian Willaert	Artusi 1600 (fols. 21 <sup>r</sup> -21 <sup>v</sup> , attr. M. Adriano) <sup>d</sup>
5	4 <sup>v</sup> -5 <sup>r</sup>	<i>Moriens lux amantissima</i>	5	Jean Mouton	°Bergamo 1209D (fols. 40 <sup>v</sup> -41 <sup>r</sup> ) Bologna Q19 (modern fols. 3 <sup>v</sup> -4 <sup>r</sup> , attr. Moton) #London 19583 / Modena F.2.29 (fols. 41 <sup>v</sup> -42 <sup>r</sup> / fol. 3 <sup>v</sup> , attr. Jo. Mouton) °Munich 1503b (fol. 9 <sup>r</sup> -9 <sup>v</sup> ) °Padua A17 (fols. 37 <sup>v</sup> -38 <sup>r</sup> ) °#Piacenza 5 (fols. 6 <sup>r</sup> -6 <sup>v</sup> ) °#Vatican 571 (fol. 4 <sup>r</sup> ) °#Vienna 4704 (only fol.)

<sup>a</sup> ° = no attribution; # = incomplete; attr. = attribution. Folio numbers are drawn from the top surviving voice.

<sup>b</sup> For a transcription of the motet, see Blackburn, 'Two Treasure Chests,' Appendix C.

<sup>c</sup> Circulates in Bologna Q20 as the contrafact *Cantate domino*.

<sup>d</sup> Circulates in Giovanni Maria Artusi's treatise as a duo.

these ascriptions could have been omitted. Indeed, in the case of *Nigra sum* the waters have been muddied not by sixteenth-century scribes or printers, but by modern scholars.

This 'tacit attribution fallacy' has a long history. Notably, the underlying principle provided the foundation for Hans Joachim Moser's *Nestertheorie*. In 1929, in relation to Lieder by Paul Hofhaimer, Moser argued that when a manuscript transmitted a stylistically plausible, anonymous work within a 'nest' of attributed ones, the anonymous work could be ascribed to the same composer.<sup>10</sup> Few scholars have been convinced by Moser's theory: as Martin Staehelin later noted, *Nestertheorie* 'has proved repeatedly to be unreliable and thus [is] useless'.<sup>11</sup> In 1973 Staehelin revised *Nestertheorie* in order to

<sup>10</sup> Hans Joachim Moser, *Paul Hofhaimer: ein Lied- und Orgelmeister des Deutschen Humanismus* (Hildesheim, 1966), 122 and 129.

<sup>11</sup> Willem Elders, 'Report of the First Josquin Meeting', in *Tijdschrift van de Vereniging voor Nederlandse Muziekgeschiedenis* 24 (1974), 20-82, esp. 25.

<b>Tabulla libro primo de la fortuna</b>			
<b>¶ mola</b>		<b>Uerdellot</b>	
<b>Sāta maria dei mater</b>	ii	<b>Se mai prouasti dōna qual sia amore</b>	viii
Adrien		Uerdellot	
<b>In tua pacie ncia per manens</b>	ii	<b>Fidel ebel cagnolo cbe tanto speso</b>	viii
<b>Nigra sum sed sun formosa</b>	iii	Marcheto	
Adrien		<b>Pensate se sudoglat de moi se</b>	x
<b>Quid nō e brieas de signat</b>	iiii	<b>Sio trouate vna dōna</b>	x
Jo mouto		Lofācio festa	
<b>Moriens in r amantissima</b>	iiii	<b>Real natura ala mia dōna auca</b>	xi
Lāzone		Uillote	
A vicas		<b>Sio ti seruo la fede minto me</b>	xi
<b>Amāti lo dico a quel cbā cor gētille</b>	v	<b>E si per bizaria cbe regna tua via</b>	xii
B B		<b>Le pur moi to feraga</b>	xiii
<b>Dōna sin questa cruda di partita</b>	vi	<b>Forzato dal dolore</b>	xiii
Marcheto		<b>La bella vendramino</b>	xiii
<b>Per cbe sō tuto foco</b>	vi	<b>Quando ritrono la mia pastorella</b>	xiii
<b>Se qāto in voi sinede</b>	vii	<b>La mi fa fa la re</b>	xv
Iberonimo de lauro		<b>Igle bien nou ri set ans</b>	xvi
<b>Dōna se nō so per cbe mi pregi amore</b>	viii	<b>Duo ie leuelai pui quil me bat</b>	xvi

Figure 1. *Libro primo de la fortuna*, table of contents. Image reproduced by permission of the Museo internazionale e biblioteca della musica di Bologna

qualify when the principles might be applied, but many, including Ludwig Finscher and Bonnie Blackburn, have judged Staehelin's revival to be dubious, too.<sup>12</sup>

In the case of Willaert, the application of tacit attributions has extended to several other works besides *Nigra sum*. In 1954 Gustave Reese suggested that Willaert had composed a five-voice setting of the sequence *Verbum bonum*, a statement that must have originated through the incorrect assumption that tacit attributions applied to the table of contents of the *Motetti de la corona, liber quarto* (Fossombrone: Petrucci, 1519; Figure 2).<sup>13</sup> More recently, Jaap van Benthem recognized that the motet *Domine quis habitabit* in the print *Motetti novi e chanzoni franciose* (Venice: Andrea Antico, 1520) has been wrongly regarded by modern scholars as being by Willaert on the basis of the attribution of the previous piece in the printed edition.<sup>14</sup> Van Benthem noted that this

<sup>12</sup> Martin Staehelin, 'Möglichkeiten und praktische Anwendung der Verfasserbestimmung an anonym überlieferten Kompositionen der Josquin-Zeit', in *Tijdschrift van de Vereniging voor Nederlandse Muziekgeschiedenis* 23 (1973), 79–91, esp. 83–87; Staehelin's remarks and the ensuing discussion in Elders, 'Report of the First Josquin Meeting', 24–29; Bonnie J. Blackburn, 'Josquin's Chansons: Ignored and Lost Sources', in *Journal of the American Musicological Society* 29 (1976), 30–76, esp. 42–43.

<sup>13</sup> Gustave Reese, *Music in the Renaissance* (New York, 1954), 369. See Alvin Johnson, review of Adrian Willaert, *Opera Omnia: Motetta VI vocum, 1542*, ed. Hermann Zenck, *Corpus Mensuralis Musicae* 3/4 (Rome, 1952), in *Journal of the American Musicological Society* 9 (1956), 133–41, esp. 136 n. 9, which first called attention to this error. Reese's collected papers indicate that he examined a microfilm of the *Motetti [...] liber quarto* from the British Library and transcribed the six-voice *Verbum bonum* himself; see New York Public Library, JPB 92-71 (Gustave Reese Papers), Series 3, Folders 92-100.

<sup>14</sup> Jaap van Benthem, 'Domine, quis habitabit in tabernaculo tuo? A Neglected Psalm Setting in Antico's *Motetti novi e chanzoni franciose*', in *Josquin and the Sublime: Proceedings of the International Josquin Symposium at Roosevelt Academy, Middelburg, 12-15 July 2009*, ed. Albert Clement and Eric Jas (Turnhout, 2011), 73–105, esp. at 75. Owens, Lockwood, Ongaro, and Fromson, 'Willaert' lists this motet as authentic; Horn, 'Willaert' considers the attribution doubtful or erroneous; Kidger, *Adrian Willaert* considers the attribution spurious.

# Tabula

	Deus in nomine tuo	viii	a	quatro
Io. lebrunga	Descendi in ortum meum	x	a	quatro
	Dulcissima uirgo maria	xii	a	quatro
Noel baldiua	Exalabo te deus meus rex	xvi	a	quatro
	Gloriosus dei ap[osto]lus Barth.	xi	a	quatro
Iosquin	Inuolata integra & castales	vi	a	cinque
Iosquin	Lectio actuum ap[osto]oloru[m]	v	a	cinque
Iosquin	Missus est angelus gabriel	iii	a	cinque
Carpentras	Miserere mei deus	vii	a	quatro
Iosquin	Misericordias domini	vii	a	quatro
	O crux aue spes unica	xiii	a	quatro
	O pulcherrima mulierum	xiii	a	quatro
Noel baldiua	Qua pulchra es	xv	a	quatro
Constantius festa	Tribus miraculis	i	a	sei
Adrianus	Verbum bonum & suau	ii	a	sei
	Verbum bonum & suau	iiii	a	cinque

Figure 2. *Motetti de la corona, liber quarto*, table of contents. Image from the Bayerische Staatsbibliothek München, Mus. pr. 247, superius, fol. 1v, <urn:nbn:de:bvb:12-bsb00077435-7>

attributive error appeared in 1980 under the entry for Willaert in the *New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians*.<sup>15</sup> In 1950 Walter Rubsamen first published an inventory for *Motetti novi*, but did not attribute *Domine quis habitabit* to Willaert; we can thus conclude that the error arose sometime between 1950 and 1980.<sup>16</sup>

At least with respect to Willaert, the phenomenon of fallacious tacit attributions does not appear to have a single point of origin. The suggestion that Willaert composed *Nigra sum* in fact long predates Moser's formulation of *Nestertheorie*: in 1892 Gaetano Gaspari claimed that the *Libro primo de la fortuna* features three works by Willaert, which we can deduce to be *In tua patientia permanens*, *Quid non ebrietas*, and *Nigra sum*.<sup>17</sup> In 1945 Alfred Einstein replicated this error in the second installment of his update to Emil Vogel's catalogue of sixteenth- and seventeenth-century Italian secular works.<sup>18</sup> There, Einstein explicitly stated what Gaspari had implicitly argued: Willaert was the author of *Nigra sum*. Einstein's reliance on Gaspari is understandable, since owing to World War II he was unable to examine the print while preparing the catalogue and thus

<sup>15</sup> Lewis Lockwood and Jessie Ann Owens, 'Willaert, Adrian', in *The New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians*, ed. Stanley Sadie (London, 1980), vol. 20, 421-28, esp. 426.

<sup>16</sup> Walter H. Rubsamen, 'Music Research in Italian Libraries: Third Installment', in *Notes, Second Series* 8 (1950), 70-99, esp. 86-87.

<sup>17</sup> Gaetano Gaspari, *Catalogo della biblioteca del liceo musicale di Bologna*, 5 vols. (Bologna, 1890-1943), vol. 2, 344.

<sup>18</sup> Einstein, 'Bibliography of Italian Secular Vocal Music', 285; Vogel, *Biblioteca della musica vocale Italiana*. See also Einstein, *The Italian Madrigal*, vol. 1, 149, which wrongly names Willaert as the author of three motets in the *Libro primo* but does not list the pieces.

had to rely on some combination of Gaspari's catalogue and his own notes that were at least six years old. Einstein's catalogue quickly became a standard reference work.

### Unraveling the Thread of *Nigra sum*

Removing *Nigra sum*'s attribution turns out not to be the end of the story, as I have discovered a pair of concordant sources: the choirbook Verona 760 (fols 70<sup>v</sup>-71<sup>r</sup>), and the tenor partbook Bologna R142 (fols 21<sup>v</sup>-22<sup>v</sup>). Verona 760 dates to the late 1520s or early 1530s and was probably compiled in the Veneto.<sup>19</sup> But little more about the manuscript is known. Laurie Stras has recently argued that the four choirbooks Verona 758-61 belonged to the Benedictine convent of Santa Lucia in Verona, but with respect to Verona 760 offers minimal evidence.<sup>20</sup> Bologna R142 is a bit better known, mostly owing to its impressive number of faulty Josquin attributions.<sup>21</sup> In dating this source, a number of scholars have called attention to a secular piece featured in the partbook, *Alti signori*, which praises Andrea Gritti (1455-1538).<sup>22</sup> Most likely, as Joshua Rifkin has recently noted, 1538 provides a *terminus ante quem* for Bologna R142: scribes would be unlikely to include the work if Gritti was no longer alive.<sup>23</sup> At the same time, 1521 marks the probable *terminus post quem* for the partbook, since Bologna R142 preserves works by Verdelot, who first appears in the historical record that year.<sup>24</sup> As for location: two pieces preserved in the manuscript, *Alti signori* and the anonymous secular work *Torelamo vilan*, reflect local Venetian repertory, and so Bologna R142—like Verona 760—probably originated in the Veneto.<sup>25</sup>

Although the location and dating of the two sources are relatively straightforward, the concordances for *Nigra sum* are not (Table 2). The altus in the *Libro primo de la fortuna* corresponds exactly not to the altus of Verona 760, but rather to the tenor. Even more interesting is the preservation of two voices in the Bologna R142 partbook (Figure 3). One voice is the altus in Verona 760 (henceforth, altus *a*); another is unique to this manuscript (altus *b*). On fol. 21<sup>v</sup>, altus *b* has the description 'Quarta Pars D[omini] Pauli di Ferraria monachi s[ancti] b[e]n[e]d[icti].'<sup>26</sup> On the opposite page above altus *a* (fol. 22<sup>r</sup>-22<sup>v</sup>), the description reads: 'Alia quarta pars si placet' (another fourth voice if you wish). Once scored up, it would appear that *Nigra sum* is a four-voice motet with two interchangeable altus voices that cannot sound at the same time (a score with both altus voices appears in Appendix 2). Both altus voices provide reasonable counterpoint that helps to complete points of imitation, and that provides an elegant homorhythmic passage in bars 32-34.

<sup>19</sup> On Verona 760, see Alan Herbert Preston, 'Sacred Polyphony in Renaissance Verona: A Liturgical and Stylistic Study' (Ph.D. diss., University of Illinois, 1969), 141-52 and 362-66; Judith Benfield, 'Music in Verona c. 1480-1530' (Ph.D. diss., University of Cambridge, 1984), 197-216 and 281-85. Neither Preston nor Benfield recognized the concordances for *Nigra sum*.

<sup>20</sup> Laurie Stras, liner notes for Musica Secreta, *Mother, Sister, Daughter* (2022), 4-5.

<sup>21</sup> On Bologna R142, see Eric Jas, 'What Other Josquin?', in *Early Music History* 33 (2014), 109-42, esp. 116-21; and most recently, Josquin des Prez, *Secular Works for Six Voices: Critical Commentary*, ed. Patrick Macey, New Josquin Edition 30 (Utrecht, 2015), 4-6. Jas probably underestimated the number of misattributions in the partbook; see Jesse Rodin, 'The Josquin Canon at 500, with an Appendix Produced in Collaboration with Joshua Rifkin', in *Early Music* 49 (2021), 473-97.

<sup>22</sup> On *Alti signori*, see Einstein, *The Italian Madrigal*, vol. 1, 325 and the literature cited in the preceding footnote.

<sup>23</sup> Joshua Rifkin, Boston University Josquin seminar, 12 April 2021.

<sup>24</sup> A letter dated 25 May 1521 from Niccolò de Pictis to Cardinal Giulio de' Medici (the future Pope Clement VII) indicates that Pictis was attempting to recruit Verdelot, who was in Florence at the time. Richard Sherr, 'Verdelot in Florence, Coppini in Rome, and the Singer "La Fiore"', in *Journal of the American Musicological Society* 37 (1984), 402-11, esp. 403-4.

<sup>25</sup> On *Torelamo vilan*, see Fenlon and Haar, *The Italian Madrigal*, 144; and Stanley Boorman, 'What Bibliography Can Do: Music Printing and the Early Madrigal', in *Music & Letters* 72 (1991), 236-58, esp. 243.

<sup>26</sup> Thanks to Leofranc Holford-Strevens for his assistance deciphering a mystery character in the description.





Figure 3. Bologna R142, fols 21v-22r. Image reproduced by permission of the Museo internazionale e biblioteca della musica di Bologna

Table 2. Concordances for *Nigra sum* and the Relationships between Voices in the Sources

	1 (= cantus)	2 (= altus <i>a</i> )	2 (= altus <i>b</i> )	3 (= tenor)	4 (= bassus)
<i>Libro primo de la fortuna</i>				altus	
Bologna R142		Alia quarta pars si placet	Quarta Pars D[omini] Pauli di Ferraria monachi s[ancti] b[e]n[e]dictj		
Verona 760					

Shading indicates that the relevant voice is lacking.

But the descriptions of the voices in Bologna R142 are curious. In the early sixteenth century, the use of the term ‘quarta pars’ to describe voices is uncommon. Indeed, no voices for any other pieces in the partbook are referred to as ‘quarta pars’; typically, the total number of voices is listed: for example, as ‘a trei’, ‘a.4.’, ‘a.cinque’, ‘a sei’, or ‘a.7.’, or the partbook names the voice (for the piece after *Nigra sum*, Pierre Moulu’s *Fiere attropos*, the scribe labelled the voice ‘tenor’). As long as the scribe of Bologna R142 correctly described the function of the voices, these descriptions suggest that neither is original. Indeed, no part-writing errors emerge from omitting both ‘quarta partes’, as neither is structural at any point; in other words, the voices do not function as the so-called cantizans or tenorizans in any of the motet’s cadences; they do not initiate any points of imitation; and removing them does not lead to part-writing errors. A non-structural altus in a four-voice composition was not common in motets composed in 1520s Italy, though it had been in repertoire from before this time. This conclusion is confirmed by the first of two tables of contents in Bologna R142, which lists *Nigra sum* under ‘Canti a trei’.

As an originally three-voice motet, *Nigra sum* would be advantageous for some institutions that lacked the resources for four-voice polyphony. But few three-voice motets were composed in 1520s Italy: taking just three of the most prominent composers on the peninsula, no sources securely dated to before 1530 preserve any motets in this disposition attributed to Willaert, Costanzo Festa, or Verdelot. As with other *si placet* voices composed in the late fifteenth and early sixteenth centuries, a fourth voice might have been added later to *Nigra sum* owing to the demands of a performance context, the inclinations of a scribe, printer, or patron, or from changed aesthetic preferences. This change in taste might explain why no surviving source features the three-voice *Nigra sum*—although it is uncertain which version the *Libro primo* preserved.

As to authorship, we can all but rule out that the Benedictine monk Paolo composed all of the voices. As Rifkin has observed, scribes and printers usually did not note the authorship of added voices; but when they did, they were specific in their attributions.<sup>27</sup> Other sixteenth-century sources preserve analogous instances of such an addition. For example, a sixth voice added to Josquin’s *Miserere mei, Deus* survives in

<sup>27</sup> Joshua Rifkin, ‘Busnoys and Italy: The Evidence of Two Songs’, in *Antoine Busnoys: Method, Meaning, and Context in Late Medieval Music*, ed. Paula Higgins (Oxford, 1999), 505–71, esp. 567. Few *si placet* voices are supplied with attributions. See Stephen Self (ed.), *The Si Placet Repertoire of 1480–1530*, Recent Researches in the Music of the Renaissance 106 (Madison, 1996).



the manuscript St. Gallen 463, where it is attributed to Bidon (that is, to Antonio Collebaudi). The description in the manuscript reads ‘Sexta vox si placet quam De Bidone composuit’.<sup>28</sup> There is little question from this description that *Miserere* was originally a five-voice motet and that Collebaudi’s contribution was limited to the sixth voice. In Bologna R142, the scribe was careful to assign only one ‘quarta pars’ to Paolo, thus implying that the other ‘quarta pars’ was added by a different, unknown author.

The two ‘quarta partes’ take different approaches in filling out the polyphony. Altus *a* preserves the imitation at the unison, but has an unusual temporal interval for its first imitative entrance. In pieces that first circulate during the 1520s that present an opening imitative motive in semibreves and which feature changes in sonority at the level of the semibreve, there are few examples in which the second voice enters after three minims. There are also few pieces where the first voice stops as the second voice enters. My suspicion is that the composer of altus *a* was uncomfortable with the ‘solo’ of one-and-a-half semibreves in the tenor in bars 2-3 and had altus *a* enter unusually in order to fill out the polyphony faster. Altus *b* meanwhile features imitation at the fifth and enters in bar 4, following the three original voices.

Even beyond the opening, *Nigra sum* is unusual. Regardless of the altus chosen, the resulting clef combination features three C<sub>2</sub> clefs and a C<sub>4</sub> clef, an atypical combination for works first circulating in the 1520s. The total range is only two octaves, making *Nigra sum* a *voci pari* motet.<sup>29</sup> Moreover, the motet’s ending is unexpected. Starting in bar 47, a repeat of the motet’s opening text is accompanied by a varied return of the initial imitative gesture. Then, in bar 62, the tenor and bassus have a conspicuous semibreve rest just prior to a concluding post-cadential extension that neatly projects ‘Hierusalem’. Altus *b* thickens the texture here with an imitative entrance.

### Identifying Paolo Ferrarese

Turning to the identity of Paolo, he can probably be identified with Paolo Ferrarese, a monk at the Benedictine monastery of S. Giorgio Maggiore in Venice.<sup>30</sup> There must have been many figures named Paolo from Ferrara, but just two can be shown to have been composers during the second half of the sixteenth century.<sup>31</sup> The first was a Benedictine monk based in Venice, the author of *Passiones, Lamentationes, Responsoria, Benedictus, Miserere* (Venice: Girolamo Scotto, 1565). A manuscript dating to 1592, Bologna U32, titled ‘Responsoria hebdom[adae]: Sancte D[omini] Pauli Ferrari Monaci s[ancti] Benedicti’, presents in choirbook format some of the music that appeared in *Passiones*.<sup>32</sup>

<sup>28</sup> St. Gallen 463, No. 213, fol. 139<sup>r</sup>. See Joshua Rifkin, ‘Singing Josquin’s *Miserere* in Ferrara: A Lesson in *Ficta* from Bidon?’, in *Instruments, Ensembles, and Repertory, 1300-1600: Essays in Honour of Keith Polk*, ed. Timothy J. McGee and Stewart Carter (Turnhout, 2013), 309-29, esp. 313.

<sup>29</sup> The bassus is separated from the upper three voices, crossing them only twice (b. 28; and with altus *a*, bb. 54-55). *Nigra sum* is one of twenty *voci pari* motets grouped at the end of Verona 760. My thanks to Laurie Stras for drawing my attention to this (personal communication, 13 January 2022).

<sup>30</sup> See Robert Eitner, *Biographisch-Bibliographisches Quellen-Lexikon der Musiker und Musikgelehrten der christlichen Zeitrechnung bis zur Mitte des neunzehnten Jahrhunderts*, 10 vols. (Leipzig, 1902), vol. 7, 312. Cf. Richard J. Agee, ‘Ferrarese, Paolo [Paolo da Ferrara]’, *Grove Music Online*, <<http://www.oxfordmusiconline.com>> (accessed 24 September 2023), which does not list the connection between Paolo Ferrarese and Bologna R142.

<sup>31</sup> Cf. Jane A. Bernstein, *Music Printing in Renaissance Venice: The Scotto Press (1539-1572)* (Oxford, 1998), 666, which conflates the two figures.

<sup>32</sup> Substantial variants make clear that Bologna U32 was not copied from *Passiones, Lamentationes*. The manuscript transmits music that roughly corresponds in the superius partbook of the printed edition to, respectively, pp. 22-29,

The second Paolo Ferrarese was a Servite from Codogno who was active at the Santa Casa in Loreto. He was the author of music in two prints: *Psalmi omnes qui ad vesperas* (Venice: Scotto, 1578), and *Letanie della Madonna* (Venice: Ricciardo Amadino, 1607). This second Paolo is often wrongly given the middle name ‘Agostino’.<sup>33</sup> One further source, *Variarum missarum liber posthumus* (Rome: Giovanni Battista Robletti, 1630), has been incorrectly attributed to him in modern scholarship; the print names the music’s author as Paolo Agostini (d. 1629), an Italian musician of the early seventeenth century and *maestro* of the Cappella Giulia.<sup>34</sup> On the basis of both chronology and geography, the author of altus *b* for *Nigra sum* can almost certainly be identified with the first Paolo Ferrarese, the author of the music in *Passiones*.

Biographical information about the Benedictine Paolo is sparse. The dedication for *Passiones*, written by an anonymous monk, includes the phrase ‘degno d’eterna fama’, so we cannot rule out the possibility that the printing was done in Paolo’s memory.<sup>35</sup> A printing contract—the only one from sixteenth-century Venice that survives—offers insight into the print run and the remuneration Girolamo Scotto received for the commission. But it does not indicate that the composer himself was involved directly or even indirectly in the publication process—the contract is between Scotto and Don Benedetto Venitiano only.<sup>36</sup> Even if in 1565 Paolo was alive and well, an attribution in Bologna R142 should now lead us to shade his career earlier than previously supposed: Richard Agee’s suggestion of *fl.* 1565 probably falls chronologically too late.<sup>37</sup>

To sum up: modern scholars have incorrectly attributed the motet *Nigra sum* to Willaert, owing to their application of the tacit attribution fallacy. The two new concordances that I have identified show that the motet was originally scored for three voices, with two *si placet* voices added later. One *si placet* voice was composed by Paolo Ferrarese, the author of the music in *Passiones*. Taking all of this together demonstrates that the process of de-attributing a work can do far more than ‘purify’ the canon of a major composer.<sup>38</sup> On the contrary, problems of attribution force us to engage with evidence that we might otherwise miss. With respect to the early sixteenth century, they also show how much more there is to discover even in well-known polyphonic sources.

43–51, and 74–84. Some responsories in the print are lacking in Bologna U32; others are different settings of the same text. The correspondences between the two sources appear to end in Bologna U32 at fol. 56r.

<sup>33</sup> Cf. Répertoire International des Sources Musicales, *Einzeldrucke vor 1800*, ed. Karlheinz Schlager, 9 vols. (Kassel, 1971–81), vol. 2, 328; and ‘Ferrario [De Ferraris], Paolo Agostino’, *Grove Music Online*, <<https://www.oxfordmusiconline.com>> (accessed 24 September 2023). I am not the first to call attention to Agostino; see Oscar Mischiati, ‘Bibliografica e musicologia’, in *Note d’archivio per la storia musicale* 3 (1985), 171–92, esp. 178.

<sup>34</sup> Cf. the Fondo Cappella Sistina in RISM and RISM at <<https://sistina.rism.info/catalog/991016982>> (accessed 24 September 2023) and <<https://rism.online/sources/991016982>> (accessed 24 September 2023).

<sup>35</sup> ‘mi sono di tanto miglior voglia disposto à dedicarle i presenti diuoti, & armoniosi canti del nostro D[on] Paulo Ferrarese, huomooltre à l’altre sue buone qualità, per la rare eccellentia sua, & in musica, & in poesia non mai à bastanza lodato, & degno d’eterna fama.’ (‘I am all the more willing to dedicate to you the present devoted, and harmonious songs of our D[on] Paulo Ferrarese, a man who, in addition to his other good qualities, is never praised enough for his rare excellence in both music and poetry and is worthy of eternal fame.’) RISM P 868, pp. 2–3. Thanks to Lorenzo Tunesi for his assistance with the translation. On the dedication, see John Bettley, ‘La compositione lacrimosa: Musical Style and Text Selection in North-Italian Lamentations Settings in the Second Half of the Sixteenth Century’, in *Journal of the Royal Musical Association* 118 (1993), 167–202, esp. 167–168.

<sup>36</sup> On the printing contract, see Richard J. Agee, ‘A Venetian Music Printing Contract and Edition Size in the Sixteenth Century’, in *Studi musicali* 15 (1986), 59–65.

<sup>37</sup> Agee, ‘Ferrarese, Paolo.’

<sup>38</sup> An argument proposed in Rodin, ‘The Josquin Canon’, 474.

## Appendix 1. Abbreviations of primary sources, with links to digitization where available

Artusi 1600	Giovanni Maria Artusi, <i>L'Artusi, ovvero delle imperfezioni della moderna musica</i> (Venice: Giacomo Vincenti, 1600)	<a href="https://gallica.bnf.fr/ark:/12148/btv1b52502738h">https://gallica.bnf.fr/ark:/12148/btv1b52502738h</a>
Bergamo 1209D	Bergamo, Civica Biblioteca 'Angelo Mai', Ms. 1209 D	
Bologna Q19	Bologna, Museo Internazionale e Biblioteca della Musica, Q.19 ('Rusconi Codex')	
Bologna Q20	Bologna, Museo Internazionale e Biblioteca della Musica, Q.20	<a href="http://www.bibliotecamusica.it/cmbm/viewschedatwbca.asp?path=/cmbm/images/ripro/gaspari/_Q/Qo20/">http://www.bibliotecamusica.it/cmbm/viewschedatwbca.asp?path=/cmbm/images/ripro/gaspari/_Q/Qo20/</a>
Bologna U32	Bologna, Museo Internazionale e Biblioteca della Musica, U.32	<a href="http://www.bibliotecamusica.it/cmbm/viewschedatwbca.asp?path=/cmbm/images/ripro/gaspari/_U/Uo32/">http://www.bibliotecamusica.it/cmbm/viewschedatwbca.asp?path=/cmbm/images/ripro/gaspari/_U/Uo32/</a>
Bologna R142	Bologna, Museo Internazionale e Biblioteca della Musica, R.142	<a href="http://www.bibliotecamusica.it/cmbm/viewschedatwbca.asp?path=/cmbm/images/ripro/gaspari/_R/R142/">http://www.bibliotecamusica.it/cmbm/viewschedatwbca.asp?path=/cmbm/images/ripro/gaspari/_R/R142/</a>
Dresden 1/D/505	Dresden, Sächsische Landesbibliothek, Ms. 1/D/505 ('Annaberger Chorbuch I')	<a href="https://digital.slub-dresden.de/werkansicht/df/168387/1">https://digital.slub-dresden.de/werkansicht/df/168387/1</a>
London 2037	London, Royal College of Music, Ms. 2037	<a href="https://archive.org/details/RCM-MS-2037">https://archive.org/details/RCM-MS-2037</a>
London 19583	London, British Library, Add. Ms. 19583	
Modena 9	Modena, Duomo, Biblioteca e Archivio Capitolare, Ms. Mus. IX	<a href="https://www.diamm.ac.uk/sources/1436/#/images">https://www.diamm.ac.uk/sources/1436/#/images</a>
Modena F.2.29	Modena, Biblioteca Estense, Ms. α.F.2.29 (Lat. 1232)	<a href="https://edl.cultura.gov.it/item/8wr29qoejm">https://edl.cultura.gov.it/item/8wr29qoejm</a> <a href="https://edl.cultura.gov.it/item/yxrlok9ero">https://edl.cultura.gov.it/item/yxrlok9ero</a>
Munich 1503b	Munich, Bayerische Staatsbibliothek, Ms. 1503b	<a href="https://stimmuecher.digitale-sammlungen.de/view?id=bsbo0104612">https://stimmuecher.digitale-sammlungen.de/view?id=bsbo0104612</a>
Padua A17	Padua, Duomo, Biblioteca Capitolare, Curia Vescovile, Ms. A.17	
Pesaro 559	Pesaro, Biblioteca Oliveriana, Ms. 559	
Piacenza 5	Piacenza, Archivio del Duomo, Fondo Musicale, s. s. (5)	
St. Gallen 462	St. Gallen, Stiftsbibliothek, Cod. Sang. 462 ('Heer Liederbuch')	<a href="http://www.e-codices.unifr.ch/en/csg/0462">http://www.e-codices.unifr.ch/en/csg/0462</a>
St. Gallen 463	St. Gallen, Stiftsbibliothek, Cod. Sang. 463 ('Tschudi Liederbuch')	<a href="https://www.e-codices.unifr.ch/en/csg/0463">https://www.e-codices.unifr.ch/en/csg/0463</a>
Treviso 8	Treviso, Biblioteca Capitolare del Duomo 8	
Vatican 571	Vatican, Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, Ms. Vat. Mus. 571	<a href="http://digi.vatlib.it/view/MSS_Vat.mus.571">http://digi.vatlib.it/view/MSS_Vat.mus.571</a>
Verona 758	Verona, Biblioteca Capitolare, Ms. DCCLVIII	
Verona 759	Verona, Biblioteca Capitolare, Ms. DCCLIX	
Verona 760	Verona, Biblioteca Capitolare, Ms. DCCLX	
Verona 761	Verona, Biblioteca Capitolare, Ms. DCCLXI	

Vienna 4704	Vienna, Österreichische Nationalbibliothek, Mus. Hs. 4704	
Zurich 906	Zurich, Zentralbibliothek, Ms. Q 906	
RISM 1519 <sup>3</sup>	<i>Motetti de la corona, liber quarto</i> (Fossombrone: Ottaviano Petrucci, 1519)	<a href="https://stimmbuecher.digitale-sammlungen.de/view?id=bsb00077435">https://stimmbuecher.digitale-sammlungen.de/view?id=bsb00077435</a>
RISM 1520 <sup>3</sup>	<i>Motetti novi e chanzoni franciose</i> (Venice: Andrea Antico, 1520)	
RISM [1526] <sup>7</sup>	<i>Messa motteti Canzonni Novamente stampate Libro primo</i> (Rome: Niccolò de' Giudici, 1526)	
RISM [c. 1530] <sup>1</sup>	<i>Libro primo de la fortuna</i> (Rome: Niccolò de' Giudici, 1526)	<a href="http://www.bibliotecamusica.it/cmbm/viewschedatwbca.asp?path=/cmbm/images/ripro/gaspari/_R/R141/">http://www.bibliotecamusica.it/cmbm/viewschedatwbca.asp?path=/cmbm/images/ripro/gaspari/_R/R141/</a>
RISM 1534 <sup>6</sup>	<i>Liber quartus.xxix.musicales</i> (Paris: Pierre Attaignant, 1534)	<a href="https://collections.thulb.uni-jena.de/receive/HisBest_cbu_00019185">https://collections.thulb.uni-jena.de/receive/HisBest_cbu_00019185</a>
RISM 1538 <sup>5</sup>	<i>Liber cantus (vocum quatuor) triginta novem motetos habet.</i> (Ferrara: Johannes de Buglhat, Antonio Hucher, and Henrico de Campis, 1538)	<a href="https://stimmbuecher.digitale-sammlungen.de/view?id=bsb00073122">https://stimmbuecher.digitale-sammlungen.de/view?id=bsb00073122</a>
RISM 1539 <sup>10</sup>	<i>Tertius Liber cum Quatuor vocibus</i> (Lyon: Jacques Moderne, 1539)	<a href="https://stimmbuecher.digitale-sammlungen.de/view?id=bsb00075670">https://stimmbuecher.digitale-sammlungen.de/view?id=bsb00075670</a>
RISM 1540 <sup>6</sup>	<i>Selectissimarum mutetarum partim quinque partim quatuor vocum</i> (Nuremberg: Johann Petreius, 1540)	<a href="http://dx.doi.org/10.25673/opendata2-4264">http://dx.doi.org/10.25673/opendata2-4264</a>
RISM W 1107	<i>Adriani Vvllaert [...] Musica quatuor vocum [...] liber primus</i> (Venice: Antonio Gardano, 1545)	<a href="https://stimmbuecher.digitale-sammlungen.de/view?id=bsb00073520">https://stimmbuecher.digitale-sammlungen.de/view?id=bsb00073520</a>
RISM W 1126	<i>Musica nova</i> (Venice: Antonio Gardano, 1559)	<a href="https://stimmbuecher.digitale-sammlungen.de/view?id=bsb00071866">https://stimmbuecher.digitale-sammlungen.de/view?id=bsb00071866</a>
RISM 1549 <sup>9</sup> and 9 <sup>a</sup>	<i>Musica quatuor vocum, que materna lingua</i> (Venice: Antonio Gardano and Girolamo Scotto, 1549)	<a href="https://stimmbuecher.digitale-sammlungen.de/view?id=bsb00077223">https://stimmbuecher.digitale-sammlungen.de/view?id=bsb00077223</a>
RISM D 1323	<i>Psalmi omnes qui ad vespas</i> (Venice: Scotto, 1578)	<a href="http://www.bibliotecamusica.it/cmbm/viewschedatwbca.asp?path=/cmbm/images/ripro/gaspari/_S/S115/">http://www.bibliotecamusica.it/cmbm/viewschedatwbca.asp?path=/cmbm/images/ripro/gaspari/_S/S115/</a>
RISM D 1324; DD 1324	<i>Letanie della Madonna</i> (Venice: Ricciardo Amadino, 1607)	
RISM DD 1324a	<i>Variarum missarum liber postumus</i> (Rome: Giovanni Battista Robletti, 1630)	
RISM P 868	<i>Passiones, Lamentationes, Responsoria, Benedictus, Miserere</i> (Venice: Girolamo Scotto, 1565)	<a href="http://www.bibliotecamusica.it/cmbm/viewschedatwbca.asp?path=/cmbm/images/ripro/gaspari/_U/U031/">http://www.bibliotecamusica.it/cmbm/viewschedatwbca.asp?path=/cmbm/images/ripro/gaspari/_U/U031/</a>

## Appendix 2. *Nigra sum*

The two *si placet* voices are placed above the three original ones

(1)  
Altus *a*  
(Verona 760, Bologna R142)

Altus *b*  
(Bologna R142)

Cantus

(2)  
Tenor

Bassus

Ni - gra sum sed

Ni - gra sum sed sum

Ni - gra sum

4

A (a).

— for - mo - sa, fi - li - a Hie -

A (b).

Ni - gra sum sed for - mo - sa, fi -

C.

for - mo - sa, fi - li - a Hie -

T.

sed sum for - mo - sa, fi - li - a

B.

(3)  
Ni - gra sum sed sum for -



8

A (a). ru - sa - lem, sed sum for - mo - sa, si -

A (b). - li - a Hie - ru - sa - lem, sed sum for -

C. ru - sa - lem, sed sum for - - - mo -

T. Hie - ru - sa - lem, sed sum for - mo -

B. - mo - sa, sed sum for - mo - sa,

12

A (a). - cut ta - ber - na - cu - la Ce -

A (b). mo - sa, si - cut ta - ber - na - cu - la

C. sa, si - cut ta - ber - na - cu - la

T. sa, si - cut ta - ber - na - cu -

B. si - cut ta - ber - na - cu - la Ce -

16

A (a).  
 - dar, si ni - gra - - - - - sum sol de - co - lo - ra -

A (b).  
 Ce - dar, Ce - dar, si ni - gra sum sol

C.  
 Ce - dar, si ni - gra sum sol

T.  
 - la Ce - dar, si ni - gra - - - - - sum

B.  
 - dar, si ni - gra sum sol

21

A (a).  
 vit me, sed sum for - mo - sa,

A (b).  
 - de - co - lo - ra - vit me, sed sum for - mo -

C.  
 - de - co - lo - ra - vit me, sed

T.  
 sol de - co - lo - ra - vit me, sed sum for -

B.  
 - de - co - lo - ra - - - - - vit me,

25

A (a). si - cut pel - les

A (b). - - - - - sa, si -

C. sum for - mo - sa, si - cut pel - les Sa -

T. mo - sa, si - cut pel - les Sa - lo - mo -

B. sed sum for - mo - sa, si - cut pel - les. Sa - lo - mo - nis,

29

A (a). Sa - lo - mo - nis. No - li - te me con -

A (b). cut pel - les Sa - lo - mo - nis. No - li - te me con - si -

C. - lo - mo - nis. No - li - te me

T. nis. No - li - te me con -

B. Sa - lo - mo - nis. No - li - te me con -

35

A (a). - si - de - ra - re quod \_\_\_\_\_

A (b). - de - ra - re quod \_\_\_\_\_ fus -

C. con si - de - ra - re quod \_\_\_\_\_ fus -

T. - si - de - ra - re quod fus -

B. si - de - ra - re \_\_\_\_\_ quod

39

A (a). fus - ca sim, qui - a sol, qui -

A (b). - ca sim, quod \_\_\_\_\_ de - co - lo - ra - vit me,

C. - ca \_\_\_\_\_ sim, qui - a sol \_\_\_\_\_ de - co - lo -

T. - ca sim, qui - a sol \_\_\_\_\_ de - co - lo -

B. fus - ca sim, qui - a de - co - lo - ra - vit me sol, de - co - lo -

44

A (a). - a sol de - co - lo - ra - vit me, de - co - lo - ra - vit

A (b). quod sol de - co - lo - ra - vit me, Ni - gra

C. - ra - vit me, qui - a sol de - co - lo - ra - vit me.

T. ra - vit me, qui - a sol de - co - lo - ra - vit me.

B. - ra - vit me. Ni - gra sum

49

A (a). me. Ni - gra - sum sed sum for - mo - sa,

A (b). sum sed for - mo - sa, sed sum for - mo -

C. Ni - gra sum sed sum for - mo - sa,

T. Ni - gra sum sed for - mo -

B. sed sum for - mo -



53

A (a). fi - li - a Hie - ru - sa - lem, sed \_\_\_\_\_ sum for -

A (b). sa, \_\_\_\_\_ fi - li - a Hie - ru - sa - lem, Hie - ru -

C. fi - li - a Hie - ru - sa - lem, #

T. sa, fi - li - a Hie - ru - sa - lem, sed \_\_\_\_\_

B. sa, fi - li - a \_\_\_\_\_ Hie - ru - sa - lem, sed sum

57

A (a). (5) (6) - mo - sa, for - mo - sa, fi - li - a Hie - ru - sa - lem,

A (b). sa - lem, fi - li -

C. sed sum for - mo - sa fi - li - a Hie - ru - sa - lem, Hie -

T. \_\_\_\_\_ sum for - mo - sa, fi - li - a Hie - ru - sa - lem,

B. for - mo - sa, fi - li - a Hie - ru - sa - lem,

62

A (a). Hie - ru - sa - lem.

A (b). a Hie - ru - sa - lem.

C. - ru - sa - - - - - lem.

T. Hie - ru - sa - lem.

B. Hie - ru - sa - lem.

Critical notes:

1. Score follows Verona 760 for altus *a*.
2. Voice wrongly designated 'cantus' in the *Libro primo de la fortuna*.
3. Verona 760, b. 5<sub>2</sub>; semibreve *e* in error.
4. Verona 760, bb. 14<sub>4</sub>-15<sub>1</sub>; 2 minims *a* and *g* in error.
5. Bologna R142, b. 57<sub>4</sub>; two minims *e*.
6. Bologna R142, bb. 59<sub>2</sub>-60<sub>1</sub>; lacking.

## Abstract

Although the motet *Nigra sum* in the *Libro primo de la fortuna* (Rome, c. 1526) has long been attributed to Adrian Willaert, he is not its composer. No sixteenth-century source ascribes the piece to him. Rather, the attribution stems from a modern practice that this study terms the tacit attribution fallacy: the construal of apparent groupings of pieces in tables of contents as evidence of attributions. Two concordances for *Nigra sum* are found in manuscripts from the Veneto: the choirbook Verona 760, and the tenor partbook Bologna R142. Together, these indicate that the motet was originally composed for three voices, with two *si placet* voices added later. Implausible attributions for pieces such as *Nigra sum* illustrate the need for more careful attention to sixteenth-century composers' work-lists. Avoiding the tacit attribution fallacy reveals how central sources such as the *Libro primo* evince a robust musical transmission.